## Detailed Table of Contents

### Summary Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Preface

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Introducing the PERM-to-Green-Card Path and the Players, Hurdles, and Traps You Are Likely to Encounter Along the Way

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Federal Agencies You Will Encounter and the Three Main Steps You Must Complete to Obtain Green Cards through PERM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Main Things the Federal Agencies Look for at Each Major Step

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **PERM at DOL**
  | Page |
  | 2    |

- **I-140 Petition at USCIS**
  | Page |
  | 2    |

- **I-485 Application (or Consular Processing at DOS)**
  | Page |
  | 3    |

### Employers, Employees, and Their Perspectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### “Employer”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Perspectives within the “Employer”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Human Resources Personnel**
  | Page |
  | 4    |

- **Technical Manager**
  | Page |
  | 4    |

- **General Counsel**
  | Page |
  | 5    |

#### Perspectives of the Employee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Why Timing is So Critical throughout the PERM-to-Green-Card Effort

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### If You Misunderstand, Miscalculate, or Miss a Deadline, Your Case May Fail

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Estimate Timing *Conservatively* to Improve Client Relations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Your Client’s Friend’s Case Always Goes Faster and Smoother

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Find and Resolve All Major Problems *Early* in the Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Together, DOL and USCIS/DOS Have “One Fist of Iron, the Other of Steel.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### If the Right One Don’t Get You, the Left One Will.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Conclusion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Knowing What to Do and When to Do It: A Step-by-Step Guide to Successful PERM Labor Certification Practice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Introduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Step 1: Exchanging Information with the Client(s)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Scope and Terms of Engagement**
  | Page |
  | 12   |

  - **Initial Contact**
    | Page |
    | 12   |

  - **Getting Terms in Writing**
    | Page |
    | 13   |

  - **Addressing and Clarifying Dual Representation**
    | Page |
    | 13   |

  - **Strategy Discussion with Employer and Employee**
    | Page |
    | 13   |

- **Employer Questionnaire**
  | Page |
  | 14   |

  - **General Company Information**
    | Page |
    | 14   |

  - **Companies with Small Number of Employees; Employee Ownership; Familial Relationships**
    | Page |
    | 14   |

  - **Employer’s “Ability to Pay” Documentation**
    | Page |
    | 14   |

  - **Layoffs**
    | Page |
    | 15   |

  - **Full-Time and Permanent Job Offer**
    | Page |
    | 15   |

- **Foreign-National Employee Questionnaires**
  | Page |
  | 15   |

  - **Basic Biographical Information for Employee and Any Dependents**
    | Page |
    | 15   |
Subsequent Employment Verification Questionnaire for Employee ........................................ 15
Step 2: Analyzing Minimum Job Requirements and Employee Qualifications ..................... 15
“Real World” Job Requirements versus PERM Job Requirements ..................................... 16
Analyzing the Job Requirements ..................................................................................... 16
Guidelines for Employers ............................................................................................... 16
“Normal” Requirements ................................................................................................. 17
Qualifying Experience with the PERM Employer ........................................................... 17
Disparate Occupations .................................................................................................... 17
Alternative Requirements ................................................................................................. 17
Carefully Analyzing the PERM Beneficiary’s Qualifications ............................................. 18
Ensuring Thoroughness in Reviewing the Exact Experience of the PERM Beneficiary ........ 18
PERM Beneficiary’s Experience Gained While with the PERM Employer ......................... 19
Education Gained While with the PERM Employer ........................................................ 20
Education, I-140 Petition, and Immigrant Visa Categories ................................................ 20
Getting It in Writing—The “Experience” Questionnaire and the “Experience” Letters .......... 21
Step 3: Prevailing Wage and Related Issues ..................................................................... 21
Submitting the Prevailing Wage Request ........................................................................ 21
2018 SOC Revisions .......................................................................................................... 22
Worksites, Telecommuting, and Traveling Post-COVID ...................................................... 22
CBA, SCA, DBA, and Alternate Surveys ............................................................................ 22
Reviewing the Prevailing Wage Determination .................................................................. 23
Options If Prevailing Wage Determination Is Unacceptable .............................................. 23
Tips for Prevailing Wages ................................................................................................. 24
Before Recruitment: “Business Necessity” for Requirements That Are Not “Normal” ........ 25
Step 4: Recruitment ............................................................................................................ 25
Mandatory Recruitment for All Occupations (Nonprofessional and Professional) .............. 25
SWA Job Order .................................................................................................................. 26
Two Sunday Ads .............................................................................................................. 26
Notice of Filing ................................................................................................................... 26
Additional Recruitment for “Professional” Occupations ..................................................... 27
Drafting PERM-Compliant Advertisements ..................................................................... 27
Clarity: How Much Information Is Enough to Apprise
U.S. Workers of the Job Opportunity? .............................................................................. 28
Wage: If the Employer Includes the Wage, What If the PERM Beneficiary Earns More
Than the Prevailing Wage; Is It Still Okay to List Only the Prevailing Wage in the
Advertisements? ............................................................................................................ 28
Understatement: Aside from Wages, What Other Terms of Employment Might Be
Considered “Less Favorable” Than Those Offered to the PERM Beneficiary? .................. 29
Timing of Recruitment Advertisements ............................................................................ 29
Strategic Choice: Who Should Place Advertisements? ...................................................... 30
Attorney Oversees Advertisement Placement ................................................................... 30
Employer Oversees Advertisement Placement ............................................................... 30
Third Party Oversees Advertisement Placement ............................................................. 31
Prompt and Thorough Followup with Applicants ............................................................. 31
Recruitment Tips .............................................................................................................. 32
Step 5: Post-Recruitment 30-Day “Quiet” Period ............................................................... 32
Completing the Audit File and Related Tasks ................................................................... 33
Reviewing Employer’s Preliminary Recruitment Results .................................................. 33
Drafting and Ensuring Accuracy of the Form ETA-9089 .......................................................... 34
Notes or Memo to Record Unusual Aspects of Case ................................................................. 34
30-Day “Quiet” Period Tips ...................................................................................................... 34
Step 6: Filing Form ETA-9089 .................................................................................................. 35
Prefiling Cleanup and Review ................................................................................................. 35
Employer Review and Approval of Final Recruitment Report ................................................. 35
Employer Confirmation of No Layoffs .................................................................................... 36
Final Review ............................................................................................................................. 36
Submission of Form ETA-9089 through FLAG ..................................................................... 36
Step 7: Postfiling Tasks ............................................................................................................ 36
Step 8: Stay Abreast of Frequent DOL Changes .................................................................... 36
Resources You Will Use Frequently ....................................................................................... 37
The PERM Regulations, 20 CFR Parts 655 and 656 ............................................................... 37
Board of Alien Labor Certification Appeals Decisions ......................................................... 37
PERM Processing Times .......................................................................................................... 37
Occupation and Wage Research ............................................................................................. 37
Conclusion ............................................................................................................................... 38

**Spotting Facts That Tell You That PERM Will Be Difficult or Impossible—and Seeking Ways to Address Such Difficulties** ..................................................... 39

**Introduction** .......................................................................................................................... 39
Facts and Circumstances Indicating That Your Client’s Case May Be a Dead End .................... 39
  The Proffered Salary Is Far Too Low and Cannot Be Raised ................................................ 39
  The Employer’s Financial Documents Indicate That They are Currently Very Weak Financially... 40
  Education/Experience Requirements Are Excessively Low in an Area of High Unemployment ... 40
Employer Insistence on Abnormally High Education and Experience Requirements ............ 41
Employer Had Recent Layoffs ................................................................................................. 41
The Beneficiary Qualifies for the Position Only Through Substantially Different Alternate Requirements ........................................................................................................................................ 42
  The Beneficiary Does Not Have the Required Degree .......................................................... 42
  The Beneficiary’s Degree Fails to Meet USCIS Equivalency Standards ................................. 42
  The Beneficiary Cannot Verify Prior Experience .................................................................. 43
  The Beneficiary Lacks Required License .............................................................................. 43
The Beneficiary Has Ownership or Familial Relationships with Sponsoring Employer .......... 43

Anticipating and Addressing Client Reaction to Learning That Their Case Cannot Go Forward .... 44
Considering Alternatives to PERM .......................................................................................... 45
Hypothetical Fact Pattern for Analyzing the Most Common Potential Alternatives to PERM .... 45
  Aliens with Extraordinary Ability (EB-1A) .......................................................................... 46
  Outstanding Professors or Researchers (EB-1B) ................................................................. 47
  National Interest Waiver (NIW) ......................................................................................... 47
  Schedule A, Group II (Exceptional Ability) ........................................................................... 48
  Multinational Executives and Managers (EB-1C) ............................................................... 48
  EB-5 Immigrant Investor Visa .............................................................................................. 49
Other Options to Explore and Consider at the Outset of the Case, If Applicable ..................... 49
  Schedule A, Group I for Professional Nurses and Physical Therapists ................................. 49
  Family- and Marriage-Based Immigration .......................................................................... 50
  Diversity Visa Lottery ........................................................................................................... 50
  Religious Workers ................................................................................................................ 50
  Asylum ................................................................................................................................... 50

Copyright © 2023, American Immigration Lawyers Association (AILA). All rights reserved.
Creating a Crystal Ball: Employer-Related Issues to Spot before Commencing a PERM Case

Section I: Collecting Information About the Employer and Employee—Identifying Approvability and Discovering Potential Pitfalls

Issues Associated with the Timing of the Filing of a PERM Application

Using the PERM Application as a Retention Tool

Beginning the PERM Process Early May Save the Employer Significant Costs in College and University Settings

A Timely Filed PERM Application Will Secure the Foreign Worker’s Ability to Maintain Work Authorization until Permanent Resident Status Is Granted

Issues Associated with the Employer’s Corporate Information

Issue: The Employer’s Legal Name

Issue: Close Familial Relationships and Foreign Worker Ownership

Issue: Employer’s Number of Employees

Issues Associated with the Employer’s Worksite Location:

Multiple Worksites, Roving Employees, and Virtual/Home Offices

Issues Associated with the Wage Offered and Proving the Employer’s Ability to Pay

Issues Associated with the Offered Position

Issue: Job Title

Issue: Education and Experience Requirements

Issue: Newly Created Positions

Issue: When Can Qualifying Experience Be Gained with the Same Employer?

Issue: Too Much of a Good Thing? Audit Triggers and Abnormal Job Requirements

Issue: Layoffs

Section II: Apprising Employers of Their Key Role, Obligations, and Commitment

When Starting the PERM Process

What Should the Practitioner Tell the Employer?

1. The Employer’s Financial Obligations

2. The Employer’s Role in Drafting the Job Description/Advertisement Text

3. The Employer’s Role in the Recruitment Process

4. The Employer’s Role with DOL

5. The Employer’s Obligation to Maintain the Compliance File

Section III: Apprising Employers of the Consequences of Sponsoring a Foreign Worker without Proper Work Authorization

Conclusion

Employee-Related Issues to Spot before Commencing a PERM Case

Section I: Identifying Potential Bases of Inadmissibility, Including Whether the Foreign Worker Is Subject to the “Bars”

Issue: Fraud-Related Grounds of Inadmissibility

Issue: Criminal Grounds of Inadmissibility

Issue: Health-Related Grounds of Inadmissibility

Issue: Public Charge Ground of Inadmissibility

Issue: Foreign Worker Entered Without Inspection or Has Accrued Unlawful Presence

Rendering Them Subject to the Three-Year, Ten-Year, or Permanent Bar

Section II: Identifying Possible Issues Relating to the Nonimmigrant Status of the Foreign Worker

Issue: Foreign Worker Is in H-1B Status and Subject to a Maximum Period of Stay
Issue: Foreign Worker is an L-1 Intracompany Transferee Subject to a Maximum Period of Stay in the United States ................................................................. 80
Issue: Foreign Worker Is or Was an Exchange Visitor in J-1 Status, Subject to the Two-Year Home-Residency Requirement ................................................................. 81
Issue: Foreign Worker Is in Nonimmigrant Worker Status Pursuant to Free Trade Agreements—TN, E-3, H-1B1 ................................................................. 82
Issue: Foreign Worker Is a Student in Nonimmigrant F-1 Status ........................................ 83
Issue: Foreign Worker Is in Other Nonimmigrant Status ........................................................ 83
Section III: Identifying When Foreign Worker Will Be Able to Pursue Permanent Residence and Capturing, When Possible, an Earlier Priority Date ........................................................... 84
Issue: The Foreign Worker’s Priority Date Based on the PERM Case to Be Filed ................. 84
Issue: Foreign Worker Was the Beneficiary of a Previously Filed Labor Certification or Petition, or May Be “Portable” ................................................................. 85
Issue: Foreign Worker Can Be “Grandfathered” under INA §245(i) ........................................ 86
Section IV: Identifying Familial Issues ................................................................. 86
Issue: The Foreign Worker Is Single ........................................................................... 86
Issue: The Foreign Worker’s and Spouse’s Country of Birth and “Cross-Chargeability” .... 87
The Nonimmigrant Status of the Foreign Worker’s Spouse ........................................ 87
Issue: The Foreign Worker’s Child Will Reach the Age of 21 before the Foreign Worker and Derivative Family Members Are Able to File I-485 Applications to Adjust Status ........ 88
Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 88

CHART TO VERIFY FOREIGN NATIONAL’S AND DERIVATIVES’ ADMISSIBILITY
BEFORE TAKING A CASE .................................................................................. 89

SCHEDULE A, GROUP II: IMMIGRANT VISA STANDARDS AND PRACTICE TIPS ............................................. 105
Introduction .................................................................................................. 105
DOL Regulations ......................................................................................... 105
The Legal Standard for Arts and Sciences ......................................................... 106
Prong 1: Widespread Acclaim and International Recognition
Accorded by Recognized Experts .................................................................... 106
Prong 2: Confirmation that the Foreign National’s Work During the Past Year Did, and Intended Work Will, Require Exceptional Ability ............................................................ 107
Prong 3: Confirmation that the Foreign National Meets at Least Two Regulatory Criteria ................................................................. 108
The Legal Standard for Performing Arts .......................................................... 110
Additional DOL Requirements ........................................................................ 110
“International” Legal Standard ........................................................................ 110
Form ETA-9089 .............................................................................................. 111
Posting Notice Requirement ........................................................................... 111
Prevailing Wage Determination ....................................................................... 111
Meeting the USCIS Requirements .................................................................. 112
Second-Preference Employment-Based Immigrant Visa .................................... 112
Third-Preference Employment-Based Immigrant Visa ........................................ 113
Conclusion .................................................................................................... 113
Appendix A: Schedule A, Group II Chart ......................................................... 115

SPECIAL HANDLING: THE COMPETITIVE EDGE ............................................. 117
Sources ........................................................................................................ 117
Statute ......................................................................................................... 117
Regulations .................................................................................................. 118
Special Handling Challenges

Establishing Model Practices Can Streamline Special Handling Cases

Qualifying Institutions and Positions

Positions That Qualify for Special Handling

What Constitutes Classroom Teaching

Combination of Occupations

Special Handling Requirements and the Step-by-Step Process

Step 1: Obtain Foreign Worker’s Date of Selection to Determine the Filing Deadline

Date of Selection for a Reselection Case

Step 2: Verify that the Institution Recruited in the Required Sources

Print Journals

Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journals

What Constitutes an Acceptable Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journal?

Is a One-Day Print Advertisement in a National Professional Journal, or One 30-Day Online Ad in an Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journal Enough?

ETA-9089: Appendix D

Step 3. Ad Content, Beneficiary Qualifications, and Rejecting U.S. Workers

Challenges in Institutional Advertising Practices

Impact of Matter of East Tennessee State

All but Dissertation (ABD)

Ad and Form Consistency

Experience: Applicable and (Non)Ambiguous Requirements

The Institution Must Show That the Selected Foreign Worker Is More Qualified Than Each U.S. Worker Who Applied for the Job

The Foreign Worker Must Satisfy Advertised Requirements

Step 4. Obtain the Selection Committee’s Report

Step 5. Obtain the Hiring Official’s Statement to Verify That the Institution Engaged in a “Competitive Recruitment and Selection Process”

Hiring Authority’s Statement Attesting to Foreign Worker’s Education and Qualifications

Step 6: Drafting Labor Certification (Form ETA-9089) for Special Handling Processing

PERM Job Opportunity and Wage Information

Job Duties and Requirements

Education Requirements

Training, Special Skills or Other Requirements

Other Special Skills or Requirements

Experience in an Alternate Occupation

Job Duties

Foreign Language Requirement

Recruitment Information (ETA-9089 Preliminary Questions and Appendix D)

Foreign Worker Information (ETA-9089 Appendix A.A –A.E)

Step 7. Obtain the Required Prevailing Wage Determination
Determining the Appropriate Source ................................................................. 145
PWD Should Be Valid/Unexpired on Date Special Handling Case Filed
under 20 CFR §656.18 .................................................................................... 147
Step 8. Provide the Appropriate Notice of Filing ............................................ 148
Step 9: Assemble the Compliance File ............................................................. 150
Step 10: Submit the Special Handling Application ........................................ 151
Step 11: Provide the Institution with the Compliance File for Its Maintenance 151
When Special Handling Based on the Original Search Cannot or Should Not Be Pursued 151
The “Reselection Procedure,” or the Basic Labor Certification Process .......... 151
When Another Process May Be More Advantageous ...................................... 152
When the Processing Times Suggest That Another Process Is Advisable: The Visa Number
Unavailability Problem .................................................................................. 152
The EB-1 Outstanding Professor Petition and the EB-1 Extraordinary Ability Petition 153
The Schedule A, Group II Process ................................................................ 154
Conclusion .................................................................................................... 154

PERM Actual Minimum Requirements: When a Beneficiary Has Gained Required
Experience, Training, or Education after Joining the Employer Filing the
Application ..................................................................................................... 155
Introduction ................................................................................................... 155
Mastering the Circuitry of Forms ETA-9141 and ETA-9089 .......................... 156
No Errors ....................................................................................................... 156
No Modification of Form ETA-9089 after Filing ............................................ 157
Weaponizing Form ETA-9089 ....................................................................... 157
The Regulatory Framework: Actual Minimum Requirements ....................... 159
Complications Involving the Beneficiary’s Experience and/or Training ............ 163
When Some or All of the Beneficiary’s Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained While
Working for the Employer Filing the Labor Certification Application ............ 163
Substantial Incomparability ......................................................................... 163
Drafting Form ETA-9089 to Show Substantial Incomparability ...................... 164
Infeasibility to Train ....................................................................................... 168
When There Has Been a Break in the Beneficiary’s Employment .................... 170
When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained with a Predecessor or Related Entity 170
When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained after Joining the Employer,
but with a Different Entity ........................................................................... 172
When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained as a Contractor Working
for the Entity Filing the Labor Certification Application .................................. 172
When the Beneficiary Has No Experience in the Position to be Certified ........... 173
Complications Involving the Beneficiary’s Education ...................................... 174
Conclusion .................................................................................................... 178

Hiring the Best Qualified Worker: PERM’s “Infeasibility-to-Train” Exception ..179
Introduction ................................................................................................... 179
Summary of Legislative Background ............................................................... 180
Infeasibility-to-Train Standards ................................................................... 181
Personnel Changes (Layoffs, Worker Attrition, Reductions in Force, Downsizing) 182
Changing Technological, Business, and Economic Circumstances ............... 184
When Training Is Impossible and the Requirements Cannot Be Reduced .......... 185
Documenting Infeasibility to Train ................................................................. 186
Conclusion .................................................................................................... 187

Copyright © 2023, American Immigration Lawyers Association (AILA). All rights reserved.
IDENTIFYING THE EMPLOYER’S REQUIREMENTS FOR THE POSITION BEFORE DRAFTING AN
APPROVABLE AND APPROPRIATE PERM APPLICATION ...........................................189
   Prepare the Job Description .................................................................189
   Determine the Appropriate O*NET Classification ................................190
   Determine the Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) Classification .........190
   Does the Position Require a Foreign Language? ....................................192
   Does the Position Require Duties That Reflect a Combination of Occupations? 193
   Can the Beneficiary Prove Qualifications for the Position? .....................194
   Three-Year Degrees and Other Equivalency Issues ..............................196
   Degree in a Different Field ...................................................................197
   Appendix 1: Evidence of Qualifications .................................................198

DOCUMENTING BUSINESS NECESSITY: THE EMPLOYER’S STATEMENT, SUPPORTING
DOCUMENTATION, AND THE NEW ETA-9089 QUESTION G.9 ........................................199
   The Information Industries Standard .................................................199
   The Business Necessity Summary: Completing Appendix C .................200
   Audit Response Documentation: The Employer’s Statement ..................200
      Preliminary Matters: Audience, Author, Format ................................201
      Developing the Employer’s Statement .............................................202
         Prong One, Step One: The Employer’s Business .............................202
         Prong One, Step Two: The Role of the Position in the Employer’s Business 202
         Prong Two: Relating the Requirements to the Duties .........................203
   Audit Response Documentation: Other Supporting Documentation ........203
   Conclusion .....................................................................................204
   Appendix A: Sample 1,500-Character Business Necessity Statement for Appendix C of Form ETA-9089 .................................................................206
   Appendix B: Sample Employer’s Statement of Business Necessity in Response to an Audit Request .................................................................207

PREVAILING WAGES UNDER PERM: HOW TO “DO THE RIGHT THING” ..................211
   Introduction ..................................................................................211
   Identifying the Right Wage Source .....................................................212
      Collective Bargaining Agreements, University Wage Scales, and Salaries for Athletes 212
      The Davis-Bacon Act and Service Contract Act ................................212
      100 Percent of Prevailing Wage ......................................................213
      Private Surveys ...........................................................................213
         Survey Criteria ........................................................................214
         Use of the Median .................................................................215
         Continuation of Past Policies ......................................................215
      BLS Is No Longer Available .............................................................216
         Permissible Components of Compensation ...................................216
   Finding the Right Job Description or Classification .............................216
      Shopping for an SOC Code .............................................................218
   Locating the Right Level ....................................................................219
      The Levels Worksheet ....................................................................222
         Step 1: Find the Correct O*NET Code and Enter the Job’s Requirements 222
         Step 2: Complete the Experience Section ......................................223
         Step 3: Complete the Education Section .......................................224
         Step 4: Complete the Special Skills and Other Requirements Section ....225
Step 5: Complete Supervisory Duties Section ................................................................. 227
Final Step: Total the Points .......................................................................................... 227
Finding the Right Wage Level When the Employer Specifies Alternative Job Requirements ................................................................. 227
Finding the Right Location for the Roving Employee .................................................. 228
Using the Right Form and Procedures ......................................................................... 229
PWD Form Validity Date .............................................................................................. 230
Arguing for the Right Wage Determination—Creating an Appeal Record .................. 232
BALCA Review ............................................................................................................. 233
Using the Right PWD in an Audit Response ................................................................. 234
How to Prevent PWD Processing Delays from Ruining Your Case .............................. 234
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 235
Appendix A .................................................................................................................. 236
Appendix B .................................................................................................................. 237

WHAT ARE SOC CODES AND WHY DO THEY MATTER IN PERM? .................................................. 239

UNDERSTANDING SVP IN PERM .................................................................................. 243
The Difference between SVP Lapsed Time and SVP Level ........................................... 244
The Number of SVP Years Credited by Education ......................................................... 244
Associate’s Degree and SVP ......................................................................................... 244
Bachelor’s Degree and SVP ......................................................................................... 245
Master’s and Doctoral Degrees and SVP ....................................................................... 245
BALCA Case Law Regarding SVP ................................................................................ 245
Cases Addressing SVP in Evaluating the Equivalency of Alternate Requirements ....... 245
Cases in Which SVP Analysis by BALCA and/or the CO Is All Wrong ......................... 246
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 248

DOCUMENTING TRAVEL REQUIREMENTS IN THE AGE OF TELECOMMUTING AND WORKFORCE MOBILITY .......................................................................................................... 251
Defining Travel Requirements .................................................................................... 251
Telecommuting, Remote Work, Telehealth .................................................................... 253
Telehealth ................................................................................................................... 254
Roving, Multiple Worksites, Relocation ....................................................................... 255
Traveling and Commuting ......................................................................................... 255
BALCA Decisions ....................................................................................................... 256
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 257

ANATOMY OF FORM ETA-9089: AN ITEM-BY-ITEM DISCUSSION ...................................................... 259
Getting to the Current Form ETA-9089 ....................................................................... 259
Introduction/History ................................................................................................... 259
Preparing the Form ETA-9089—Item by Item ............................................................. 260
Instructions for the Form ........................................................................................... 260
When to Use This Form .............................................................................................. 261
Preliminary Questions on the Form ETA-9089 ............................................................ 261
Supervised Recruitment (paper form Item H.a) ............................................................ 261
Occupation Type (paper form Item H.b) ...................................................................... 261
Section A: Employer Information ................................................................................ 262
Items A.1 and A.2: Legal Business Name/Trade Name/DBA .................................... 263
Items A.3 through A.9: Employer Address .................................................................. 263
Items A.10 and A.11: Employer Telephone Number .................................................... 263
Item A.12: Federal Employer Identification Number (FEIN) from IRS .................... 263
Item A.13: NAICS Code .............................................................................................. 264
Section B: Employer Point of Contact

Items B.1 through B.11: Contact’s Name, Job Title, and Address

Items B.12 through B.14: Contact Information, Telephone Number, and Email Address

Section C: Attorney or Agent Information

Section D: Foreign Worker Information

Item D.1: Completed Appendix A Attached?

Item D.2: Has the employer contracted with an agent or attorney that also represents the foreign worker covered by this application?

Section E: Job Opportunity and Wage Information

Item E.1: Prevailing Wage Determination Case Number

Item E.2: If a valid PWD has not been obtained due to the employer being required to undergo supervised recruitment indicate whether a completed Form ETA-9141 is attached to this application.

Items E.3 and E.4: Offered Wage

Item E.5: Additional conditions about the offered wage (limited to 500 characters)

Section F: Area of Intended Employment (Worksite Information)

Items F.a through F.c: Worksite Information (where work is to be performed)

Section G: Additional Job Opportunity Information and Other Requirements

Item G.1: Is this a permanent position offering full-time employment of generally 35 hours or more?

Item G.2: Is the employer seeking labor certification for live-in household domestic service worker?

Item G.3: Employer willing to accept foreign diploma/degree?

Item G.4: Foreign Worker Currently Working for Employer?

Item G.5: Is the Employer Relying Solely on Experience the Foreign Worker Gained with the Employer?

Item G.6: Does the Job Require the Worker to Live on the Employer’s Premises?

Item G.7: Does the job involve a combination of occupations?

Item G.8: Foreign language required or preferred?

Item G.9: Do the job requirements exceed the Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) level?

Item G.10: Did the employer use a credentialing service to qualify the foreign national for the job opportunity?

Item G.11: Has the Employer Received Payment of Any Kind for the Submission of This Application?

Item G.12: Has the Employer Had a Layoff in the Area in the Occupation or Related Occupation within Six Months Preceding the Filing of This Application in the Area of Intended Employment?

Section H: Recruitment Information

Items H.c.1a. and H.c.1b: Start/End Dates for SWA Job Order

Items H.c.2 through H.c.3: Is There a Sunday Edition of the Newspaper (of General Circulation) in the Area of Intended Employment?
Item H.d: Additional Recruitment Requirements for Professional Occupations under 20 CFR §656.17(e)(ii) .......................................................... 282
Item H.e: Notice of Posting (Filing) ............................................................. 286
Section I: Employer Labor Condition Statements/Attestations .................. 288
Section J: Preparer ................................................................................. 289
Appendix A: Foreign Worker Information .............................................. 289
Appendix A.A: Foreign Worker Contact Information .............................. 289
Appendix A.B: Foreign Worker Education .............................................. 290
Appendix A.C: Foreign Worker’s Training, Certification(s), and/or License(s) Information .......................................................... 291
Appendix A.D: Foreign Worker’s Skills, Abilities, Proficiencies .............. 291
Appendix A.E: Foreign Worker’s Work Experience .................................. 291
Appendix B: Additional Worksite Information ........................................ 292
Appendix C: Supplemental Information .................................................. 292
Appendix D: Special Recruitment for College and University Teachers under 20 CFR §656.18 ......................................................... 292
Appendix D.1: Date Foreign Worker Selected for the Position ................. 292
Appendix D.2 through D.4: Name of National Professional Journal, Educational Organizational Publication, or Other Publication in Which Advertisement Placed, with Start Date of Advertisement ........................................ 293
Appendix D.5: Specify Additional Recruitment ........................................ 293
Submission of Form ETA-9089 in FLAG .................................................. 293
Audit of Form ETA-9089 ........................................................................ 294
Form ETA-9089 Final Determination: Permanent Employment Labor Certification Approval ................................................................. 294
Item A: For Government Use Only .......................................................... 294
Item B. Foreign Worker Declaration ....................................................... 294
Item C: Attorney or Agent Declaration .................................................... 294
Item D: Employer Declaration ............................................................... 295
Postadjudication and Other Issues ........................................................... 295
Withdrawal of Form ETA-9089 in the FLAG System ................................ 295
Withdrawal of Legacy ETA Form 9089 and Refiling ................................. 295
Multiple Filings ..................................................................................... 296
Validity Period ..................................................................................... 296
Amendments ....................................................................................... 297
Employer Reorganization ...................................................................... 297
Request for Duplicate Certified Form ETA-9089 ...................................... 298
Attachment A: Prevailing Wage Guidance Chart of Impact of Job Requirements on Wage Levels ................................................................. 299
Attachment B: Comparison of SVP and O*NET Guidelines for Education and Experience Requirements .................................................. 300
Attachment C: Important DOL Email Addresses .................................... 301

**DRAFTING PERM APPLICATIONS TO ENSURE I-140 APPROVAL** ................................................................. 303

Introduction ......................................................................................... 303
The Foreign National Needs to Meet the Requirements as Stated on the Form ETA-9089 ................................................................. 303
The Foreign National Must Prove They Meet Every Requirement .......... 304
Education Requirements ..................................................................... 304
Education Documentation .................................................................... 305
Credentials Evaluation ......................................................................... 305
Training Documentation ....................................................................... 305
Experience Documentation ................................................................... 305
Employer Unavailability ....................................................................... 306
When and How Should Employers Use the Kellogg Language in PERM Applications? .......................................................... 317

Introduction.............................................................................. 317

*Matter of Francis Kellogg, Pre-PERM*...................................... 318

Current Kellogg Standards ........................................................ 318

May the CO Deny an Application for Failure to State the Kellogg Language on Form ETA-9089? .......................... 320

When Is an Employer Not Subject to the Kellogg Language? ........ 321

Which Requirements Are Not Considered “Substantially Equivalent”? ................................. 323

Conclusion ................................................................................ 324

The Recruitment Process under PERM ........................................ 327

Introduction .............................................................................. 327

Recruitment Procedures ............................................................ 327

Recruitment Timeframe Calculations ........................................ 329

Newspaper Advertisements ....................................................... 329

Selection of Newspapers of General Circulation ....................... 330

The Employer’s Name ............................................................... 330

Where to Apply ....................................................................... 330

The Job Description; Multiple Job Opportunities ..................... 331

Identifying the Geographic Area ................................................. 331

Obtaining a Prevailing Wage and the Option of Including It in the Advertisement ...................... 333

Journal Advertisements ............................................................. 333

Placing a Job Order .................................................................. 334

Additional Recruitment Steps for Professional Positions ........... 335

Notice of Filing Requirements .................................................. 336
Detailed Table of Contents

Avoid Duplicating Recruitment Methods .......................................................... 337
Trust but Verify! ................................................................................................. 337
Conducting and Documenting Recruitment ..................................................... 338
The Recruitment Report .................................................................................... 338
  When an Employer Does Not Need to Reach Out to a Job Applicant; ............ 339
  When Further Inquiry Is Required ................................................................. 339
  What Constitutes a “Reasonable Period of On-the-Job Training” ................ 339
  Telephone Interviews and Written Questionnaires ...................................... 341
  The Timeliness and Manner of Contact ......................................................... 341
  The Attorney’s Role in the Labor Certification Process ............................... 342
Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 343

The 10 Additional Recruitment Steps for Professional Positions .................. 345
Introduction ...................................................................................................... 345
  Advertisement Content ................................................................................... 346
  Job Fairs ......................................................................................................... 347
  Employer’s Website ........................................................................................ 347
  Job Search Website Other Than the Employer’s .......................................... 347
  On-Campus Recruiting .................................................................................. 348
  Trade or Professional Organizations .............................................................. 348
  Private Employment Firms ............................................................................ 348
  Employee Referral Program with Incentives ................................................. 349
  Campus Placement Offices ............................................................................ 349
  Local and Ethnic Newspapers ....................................................................... 350
  Radio and Television Advertisements ........................................................... 350
Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 350

To Batch or Not to Batch (the PERM Recruitment) ....................................... 351
  So Many PERMs, So Little Time ..................................................................... 351
  “What Is Batching?” ....................................................................................... 351
  Types of Job/Company Profiles That Best Benefit from Batch ................... 351
  How Do You Batch? ....................................................................................... 352
  Benefits and Pitfalls of Batching ................................................................... 353
    Benefits ......................................................................................................... 353
    Pitfalls .......................................................................................................... 354
  Pro Tips .......................................................................................................... 354
Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 355

The New Normal in PERM Recruitment: Compliance with State and Local Equal Pay Transparency Laws in Job Postings ........................................... 357
Introduction and Scope .................................................................................... 357
Refresher Overview of PERM Prevailing Wage, Advertising, and Notice Requirements ................................................................. 358
The Impact of State and Local Wage Transparency Laws on PERM Advertising and Notice of Filing Content ........................................................................... 359
  Rumor Control: The Concept of Federal Preemption ................................... 359
  The New Job Posting Tug-of-War: Complying with Two Sets of Laws ....... 360
    Practice Methodology ................................................................................... 361
  All-in-One: EPT Laws with a Built-In Long-Arm Reach ............................... 361
Keeping it Simple: Suggested Best Practices for Compliance in PERM Recruitment and Notices of Filing ......................................................................... 362
  What PERM Steps? ....................................................................................... 362

Copyright © 2023, American Immigration Lawyers Association (AILA). All rights reserved.
What Wage Data? .......................................................... 363
What Ifs? ........................................................................ 363
Final Practice Pointers ................................................... 363
Conclusion ...................................................................... 364
Appendix: Job Postings: Equal Pay Transparency Chart by Jurisdiction .................................................. 365

LAYOFF PROVISIONS UNDER PERM .................................................. 373
DOL’s Pre-PERM Treatment of Layoffs ....................................... 373
Layoffs under PERM .......................................................... 374
Practice Pointers ................................................................ 378
Conclusion ...................................................................... 378

WHEN IS A JOB CLEARLY OPEN? TOWARDS A UNIFIED THEORY OF 20 CFR §650.10(c)(8) ......... 379
History .............................................................................. 379
Scope .............................................................................. 379
Purpose, Standard, and Application ......................................... 380
Recent Developments ........................................................... 381
Successful Defense ............................................................. 382
Conclusion ...................................................................... 383

LAWFUL, JOB-RELATED REASONS AN EMPLOYER CAN USE TO REJECT AN APPLICANT ....... 385
Introduction ...................................................................... 385
Lack of Major Requirement and No Alternative Field of Study or Alternative Combination of Education and Experience Accepted ...................................................... 385
When a Duty Arises to Conduct Further Inquiry .......................... 386
Perform Job Opportunities during a Reasonable Period of On-the-Job Training ........................................... 386
Lack of Experience is a Lawful Reason for Rejecting Applicants ................................................................. 387
Unwillingness to Accept Offered Wage .................................. 387
Specific Job Requirements Must Be Explicit ............................. 387
Applicant is Not a U.S. Citizen or Legal Permanent Resident .......................................................... 387
Conclusion ...................................................................... 388

PERM AUDITS: TRUMP’S INCREASING SCRUTINY AND BIDEN’S ENFORCEMENT PRIORITIES—OPPONENTS ALIGN ........................................................................................................... 389
Introduction ...................................................................... 389
What Is a PERM Audit? ........................................................ 390
Types of PERM Audits .......................................................... 392
Preparing for a Random Audit: Compiling the Audit Package before Filing the Application .......................... 392
General Documentation Requests Contained in Most or All Audits .............................................................. 393
Whether to Include SWA Job Order Documentation in the Audit Response .................................................. 395
Preparing the Recruitment Report ........................................... 395
Preparing Business Necessity Documentation ............................................ 396
Strategies for Remedying Errors in the Context of a PERM Audit ................................................................. 399
Errors on the Form ETA-9089 ................................................ 399
Strategies for Remedying Missing Documentation in the Context of a PERM Audit ........................................... 399
Audits Requesting Copies of Applicant Résumés ......................... 400
Demonstrating U.S. Worker Applicants Could Not Obtain Missing Skills through On-the-Job Training .......................................................... 400
Audits Requesting Evidence That There Have Been No Improper Payments by the Employer or Foreign National .................................................. 401
Audit Triggers: Anticipating and Preparing for Specific Requests Contained in Targeted Audit Notices .......................... 401
### Detailed Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proof of Business Necessity</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requirements Exceeding the SVP Level for the Occupation</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Language Requirement</td>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation That the Employer’s Alternative Requirements Are “Substantially Equivalent” to the Primary Requirements for the Job Opportunity</td>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree Equivalencies</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation That Experience Gained with the Sponsoring Employer Is “Not Substantially Comparable” to the Position Specified on the Application, or That It Is No Longer Feasible for the Employer to Train a Worker for the Position</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation of Compliance with Layoff Requirements</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee Referral Programs</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Live-In Domestic Workers</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvements for the PERM Audit Program</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conquering the Maze of Supervised Recruitment: An Overview</strong></td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What Is SR and Why Was My Case Placed in SR?</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of the SR Process</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common SR Issues and Pitfalls</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Employer Expectations</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deadlines and Technical Issues</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent Developments at BALCA</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1: Sample Notification of Supervised Recruitment</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2: Sample Recruitment Instructions</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3: Sample Recruitment Report Instructions</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>To File or Not to File: Strategies for Carrying a PERM through the Final Act of Appellate Review</strong></td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing the Case</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requests for Reconsideration</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request for BALCA Review</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is a Request for Review the Best Option?</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing Your Request for Reconsideration to the CO or Request for BALCA Review</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulatory Requirements</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Considerations</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Drafting the Request for Reconsideration or Review</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heading</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Case</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard of Review</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jurisdiction</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing Thoughts</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1: Sample Audit Notification</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2: Sample Response to Audit Notification</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3: Sample PERM Denial Notice</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 4: Sample Request for Reconsideration</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WORST-CASE SCENARIOS: REVOCATION, INVALIDATION, DEBARMENT, SUSPENSION, APPEAL, AND THE PARAMOUNT IMPORTANCE OF DOCUMENT RETENTION .................................................................453
Introduction ..................................................................................................................453
Labor Certification Determination .................................................................................453
Supervised Recruitment ................................................................................................454
Revocation of Approved Labor Certification .................................................................456
Invalidation of Labor Certification ................................................................................456
Suspension and Debarment ..........................................................................................456
Appeal to the Board of Alien Labor Certification Appeals ........................................457
Document Retention .....................................................................................................458
Conclusion .....................................................................................................................459
ETHICS IN PERM: WHERE THE LINE IS AND HOW TO DRAW IT ................................461
Drafting the Job Description ..........................................................................................461
What Are the Job Description Parameters in a PERM Labor Certification? ...............462
Who Should Drive the Process of Confirming the Job Description and Requirements? 463
To What Extent May Preference Category Implications Impact the Identification of Job Requirements? .................................................................463
What Is an Attorney’s Role When an Employer’s Job Description Is Less Than Well Defined? 464
Recruitment Sources ....................................................................................................464
Reviewing Applicants ....................................................................................................465
Willing, Able, and Available ..........................................................................................466
Diversion ........................................................................................................................467
Layoffs ............................................................................................................................467
Document Retention: Where Does the Attorney’s Role End? ....................................468
Client Relations: What to Do When You Have an Uncooperative Client ....................470
“Help, I’m Over My Head!”: When to Call a Mentor ................................................... 471
APPENDIX OF SAMPLE LETTERS, CHECKLISTS, MEMOS, CHARTS, AND OTHER PRACTICE AIDS .................................................................473
Template 1: PERM Labor Certification Checklist ..........................................................477
Template 2: Memorandum Regarding Labor Certification ...........................................479
Template 3: Form of Engagement Letter Content .......................................................483
Template 4: Form of Dual Representation Letter .........................................................485
Template 5: Employer Intake (All Employers) ...............................................................487
Template 6: Job Description/Minimum Requirements Document ...............................489
Template 7: Employer Intake (Small Employers) ..........................................................493
Template 8: Set Up An Account on DOL’s FLAG System ............................................495
Template 9: Employee Intake .........................................................................................497
Template 10: Employee Qualification Checklist .........................................................503
Template 11: Form of Correspondence Relaying Skill/Experience/Etc. Statements ..........505
Template 12: Sample Business Necessity Questions for Employer ..............................509
Template 13: Form of Business Necessity Memorandum ...........................................511
Template 14: Notice of Filing .......................................................................................515
Template 15: PERM Advertising Efforts Chart .............................................................517
Template 16: Recruitment Calculation Timeline ..........................................................519
Template 17: Recruitment Instruction Memorandum ...................................................521
Template 18: Form of Audit File Cover Sheet and Index ..............................................529
Template 19: Form of Recruitment Report ....................................................................531
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Template</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Prefiling Review Request Correspondence</td>
<td>533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Postfiling Memorandum to File</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>PERM Document Retention Checklist</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Form of Employer Filing Confirmation Correspondence to Employer</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Postfiling Correspondence Regarding Status of Case and Processing Time</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Form of Audit Response Letter</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SUBJECT-MATTER INDEX**

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

547